‘Short of a Picnic?’
Reconsidering sandwich-programs in cruise education

Prof. Dr. Alexis Papathanassis
Imke Matuszewski
Prof. Dr. Kai Havekost

4th International Cruise Conference – Leeuwarden
(Netherlands)
# Table of Contents

- Background: Sandwich Programmes in Tourism and Cruises
  - Literature Review: Some Critical Views
- Research Methodology and Findings:
  - Research Design: General Morphological Analysis (GMA)
  - Tentative Models: The cruise – student, - employer and - educator perspectives
- Implications & Discussion
  - Research Design: Cross Consistency Assessment (CCA)
  - Perspective comparison on the roles of: Intern-employment organisation, education programme, and interns / students
- Conclusions & Contribution
- Appendix
BACKGROUND – SANDWICH PROGRAMMES IN TOURISM AND CRUISES

Some Critical views
Research Questions

Does it make sense to include a compulsory internships in a tourism & cruise programme’s curriculum?

1st & 2nd Year of Studies

Internship (Full or Half Year Internship)

Final Year of Studies

What are the factors determining internship perceptions / satisfaction?

How do those perceptions differ amongst the different stakeholders?
## Literature review: Understanding the ‘Sandwich’s Ingredients’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Findings</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>PLACEMENTS</strong></td>
<td>Matching placement students' perception of internships with expectations and communication on the benefits of internships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Obstacles: Frustration of getting an internship during recession times, lack of: understanding of the value of work experience, drive and determination</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Proposition: Expectation management, encouragement and communication on the benefits of internships</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Placement Advantages for employers: Flexible human resource and low pay.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Placement Challenge: Harmonise student / study requirements &amp; employer benefits</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOURISM STUDENTS</strong></td>
<td>Tourism students’ expectation-reality mismatch:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Preference of work-experience over formal degree</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Tourism-student education challenges:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Untraditional career ambitions (emphasis on job autonomy, pleasant life style, and job permanence)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Practice-focused Learning style (Concrete rather than abstract, and active rather than reflective)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Freshers = no real understanding of the types of work available and employment conditions in the industry</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Insufficient orientation provided by academic staff</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>‘STUDIES VS. STUDIES’</strong></td>
<td>‘Location, location, location’ — The relative importance of country, institution and program: A study of tourism postgraduate students, 17, 44–52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Primary criterion for PG programme choice is geographical location</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• International students -&gt; a country’s natural attributes are the most important factor followed by aspects such as the education system</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Exposure to the tourism industry -&gt; negative attitudes (low wages and limited career progression)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Growing disenchantment of young people (esp. in hospitality)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Image worsening</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Cruise Management Students’ Evaluation of their Internships Programme – Internship Disconnect?

### Overall Evaluation of Internship

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Satisfied / Good</th>
<th>OK / Neutral</th>
<th>Not Satisfied / Not Good</th>
<th>Not Included / Mentioned</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td>177 100%</td>
<td>177 100%</td>
<td>177 100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Study Programme Fit

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Overall Evaluation of the Internship</th>
<th>Study Programme Fit</th>
<th>Future Career Fit</th>
<th>Supervision Quality</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied / Good</td>
<td>135 76%</td>
<td>39 22%</td>
<td>51 29%</td>
<td>123 69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OK / Neutral</td>
<td>34 19%</td>
<td>26 15%</td>
<td>24 14%</td>
<td>26 15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Satisfied / Not Good</td>
<td>8 5%</td>
<td>12 7%</td>
<td>9 5%</td>
<td>17 10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Included / Mentioned</td>
<td>0 0%</td>
<td>100 56%</td>
<td>93 53%</td>
<td>11 6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Future Career Fit

- **Correlation Table**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Overall Evaluation of Internship</th>
<th>Study Programme Fit</th>
<th>Future Career Fit</th>
<th>Supervision Quality</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>,001</td>
<td>,986</td>
<td>,194** ,351**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Correlation**

- **Satisfaction correlates with future career fit and supervision quality**

- **Programme and Internship... What programme!?**

**Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).**
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY & FINDINGS

General Morphological Analysis (GMA)
Analysis: Descriptives, Correlation
Synthesis: Extraction of Relevant Questions
Analysis: Open Coding
Synthesis: Axial-, Selective- Coding
Synthesis: Cross Consistency Assessment (CCA)
Analysis: Issue Extraction

Cruise Employers (10 Semi-Structured Interviews)
Cruise Students (177 Internship Report Content Analysis (Descriptive / Quantitative))
Research Questions:
- Disconnect between degree programme and internship?
- Stakeholder worldviews?
- Tentative factors determining internships perceptions

Cruise Students (34 Internship Report Content Analysis (Qualitative))

Cruise Educators (5 Semi-Structured Interviews)

Cruise Employer (CE) – related Findings:
- Internship perception model -> Tentative hypotheses for quantitative testing
- Worldview Description

Cruise Educator (CED) – related Findings:
- Internship perception model -> Tentative hypotheses for quantitative testing
- Worldview Description

Cruise Student (CS) – related Findings:
- Internship perception model -> Tentative hypotheses for quantitative testing
- Worldview Description

Synthesis: CE Cluster Formation & Issue Extraction
CEs’ perceptions of their own role
CEs’ perceptions of the CEd role
CEs’ perceptions of the CS role

Synthesis: CS Cluster Formation & Issue Extraction
CSs’ perceptions of the CE role
CSs’ perceptions of the CEd role
CSs’ perceptions of their own role

Synthesis: CEd Cluster Formation & Issue Extraction
CEds’ perceptions of the CE role
CEds’ perceptions of the CEd role
CEds’ perceptions of their own role

© Alexis Papathanassis, Imke Matuszewski, Kai Havekost

Cruise Students’ Perspective: “The world is my oyster... and I am the pearl”

**Education Programme** (Learning Complementarity)

- Study relevance
- Org. learning

**Employment Organisation** (Recognition & Self-Determination)

- Working conditions
- Recognition / fairness
- Placement work expectations
- Supervision & employer support
- Social experience

**Student Benefit** (Life Enrichment)

- Travel / tourism experience
- Self-discovery

“Have a peek behind the scenes and get an overview of the company”

“Feel valued and be treated with care and attention”

“See the world, get to know different people and collect memorable experiences”

© Alexis Papathanassis, Imke Matuszewski, Kai Havekost
Cruise Students’ Perspective
Indicative Codes

“Regardless the qualification a decent way of treating others and keeping to commitments forms the basis of trust”

“For me the main criterion for choosing an internship was: Get out of Bremerhaven, get out of Germany”

“I learned to handle problems and emergencies creatively and on my own. The fast changing team challenged my flexibility and self-motivation. At the same time I experienced to work within an hierarchy”

“As I was not able to do an internship on board a cruise vessel as to gain ship-related experience, I consider my 6th semester as a partial failure and waste of time”
Cruise Employers’ Perspective
“Internships are investments... that should pay off!”

Education Programme
(Experience Transfer)

- Future Studies

Employment Organisation
(Administrative Efficiency)

- Administration
- Organisation

Future Studies

CE Internship perception

- Work Experience
- Future Employment

Internship Architecture

Future Motives

“Bring what they experienced in the classroom”

“Make sure that interns add-value without costing too much”

“Prepare them for future employment”

Student Benefit
(HR Development)

© Alexis Papathanassis, Imke Matuszewski, Kai Havekost
Cruise Employers’ Perspective
Indicative Codes

“Interns are our future employees.”

“Internships are win-win situations.”

“It is important for students to get practical experience in real life organisations.”

“We would like to employ more interns (...) Timing is difficult, while we receive 30 applications for summer, we only receive 3 for winter.”

“We need to find the right balance between give-and-take.”
Cruise Educators’ Perspective
“What is good for the programme is good for the students”

“It is a must for any cruise study programme”

“Companies are obliged to support and contribute to the education of the future worker generation”

“It adds to their CV and they get to learn what cannot be taught in the classroom”

© Alexis Papathanassis, Imke Matuszewski, Kai Havekost
“We felt that internships were essential, because firstly they drew in applicants to the degree.”

“When they finish their internship they are able to extract so much more from their experiences in the classroom, it brings more issues on the table and enhances class work.”

“If we show that we have qualified students the reputation of the program raises among employers.”

“The point I have made and I want to reinforce is that this (supervision) is a critical part of the curriculum. You need a person devoted to this full-time. Otherwise it won’t work.”

“There is a strong relationship between good internship and starting a career right after graduation.”

“Undoubtedly students benefit greatly from internship, they are different people when they come back, really tuned-into professional life.”
IMPLICATIONS & DISCUSSION

Cross Consistency Assessment (CCA): Comparing Worldviews

“The world is my oyster... And I am the pearl”

“Internships are investments... that should pay off!”

“What is good for the programme is good for the students”
Employment Organisation Perceptions: CCA: Identifying Clusters & Recommendations

- CE, CS: High level of convergence
- CEd: Medium level of convergence
- CSF = Ongoing management of placement work expectations

Recommendations:
- Recruiting phase (Brief job description vs. rich job content)
- Experiential phase (Regular communication between CEs-CEds-CSs)
- Reflection Phase (Formalised 9-way feedback mechanisms)

Reflective Questions:
- Where should the responsibility for an internship description lie?
- To what extent do employers see internships as part of their CSR activities?

© Alexis Papathanassis, Imke Matuszewski, Kai Havekost
Education Programme Perceptions:
CCA: Identifying Clusters & Recommendations

- CE, CS: High level of convergence
- CEd: Low level of convergence
- CSF = Clarification of the ‘Curriculum-Practice’ Relationship
  - Complementarity vs. Substitution Continuum
    - Is the internship an extra ingredient to the student’s CV? Or are there synergies intended?
  - Vocational training vs. Formal academic education
    - Does the internship serve the programme or visa versa?

- Recommendations:
  - Internship management coordination (Formalised partnerships, common conceptualisation and standards)
  - Cross-Marketing (Visibility and promotion of partners by both sides)

- Reflective Questions:
  - Should a programme contain an internship at all?
  - And if it does, when should it take place (Before the study as an entry requirement, Mid-study, or at the end as a transitional point)
Student Perceptions:
CCA: Identifying Clusters & Recommendations

- CEd, CE: High level of convergence
- CS: Low degree of convergence
- CSF = Formalisation and alignment of career-, learning-, and hidden-agendas

Recommendations:
- Set and communicate standards related to work-life balance on board for interns
- 360 degree evaluation (incl. Students scoring employers, employers grading students’ internships)
- ‘Internship fun factor’ Award (tourism & cruises are about fun after all...)

Reflective Questions:
- Do internships really help the career of students or the bottom line of employers?
- Is the actual ‘psychological contract’: “I work for free, to have fun”?
CONCLUSIONS & CONTRIBUTION

“Research as a Club Sandwich”
# CCA Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster Description</th>
<th>Relevant Axial Codes</th>
<th>On Students</th>
<th>On Education Programme</th>
<th>On Employment Organisation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hidden Agenda</td>
<td>• Tourism / Travel Experience • Self-Discovery</td>
<td>Curriculum – Practice</td>
<td>• Study Relevance • Org. Learning</td>
<td>Recruiting Phase • Working Conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career Agenda</td>
<td>• Future Employment</td>
<td>Curriculum – Practice</td>
<td>• Future Studies</td>
<td>Recruiting Phase • Intern. Architecture • Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning Agenda</td>
<td>• Work Experience</td>
<td>Curriculum – Practice</td>
<td>• Class Work</td>
<td>Experiential Phase • Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career Agenda</td>
<td>• Future Employment • Career Fit</td>
<td>Curriculum – Practice</td>
<td>• Internship Management</td>
<td>Reflection Phase • Future Motives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning Agenda</td>
<td>• Work Experience</td>
<td>Coordination</td>
<td>• Programme Attractiveness</td>
<td>Reflection Phase • Reputation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hidden Agenda</td>
<td>• Social Experience</td>
<td>Co-Marketing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© Alexis Papathanassis, Imke Matuszewski, Kai Havekost
Methodological contribution:

- Cruise context specific application of the GMA Approach:
  - ‘Totality research’ – Help discover new relationships or configurations, which may not be so evident (Ritchey, 1998)
  - Current research primarily focuses on students’ perceptions / worldview (and when other worldviews are considered it is usually the employer’s)

Research / theoretical contribution:

- Tentative models of internship perceptions (cruise-students, cruise-employers and cruise-educators) -> Input for quantitative validation
- Reflective questions -> Trigger for further research

Professional contribution:

- Recommendations for improvement of internship satisfaction for all the ‘ham-holders’ involved